

North Herts District Council Audit Committee Progress Report 6 December 2012

Recommendation

Members are recommended to:

- Note the Internal Audit Progress Report
- Approve the amendments to the Audit Plan as at 9 November 2012; and
- Agree removal of implemented high priority recommendations

Contents

- 1 Introduction and Background
 - 1.1 Purpose
 - 1.2 Background
- 2 Audit Plan Update
 - 2.1 Delivery of Audit Plan and Key Findings
 - 2.3 High Priority Recommendations
 - 2.5 Proposed Amendments to Audit Plan
 - 2.6 Performance Management

Appendices

- A Progress against the 2012-13 Audit Plan
- B Implementation Status of High Priority Recommendations

1. Introduction and Background

Purpose of Report

- 1.1 This report details:
 - a) Progress made by the Shared Internal Audit Service (SIAS) in delivering the Council's Annual Audit Plan for 2012-13 as at 9 November 2012.
 - b) Findings for the period 25 August 2012 to 9 November 2012 for audits assessed as 'Limited', or 'No' assurance (there were none in the period).
 - c) Proposed amendments to the approved 2012-13 Audit Plan.
 - d) Implementation status of previously agreed high priority audit recommendations and to agree removal of completed actions.
 - e) An update on performance management information as at 9 November 2012.

Background

- 1.2 The 2012-13 Annual Audit Plan was approved by the Finance, Audit & Risk Committee on 1 March 2012.
- 1.3 The Finance, Audit & Risk Committee receives periodic updates against the Annual Internal Audit Plan, the most recent of which was brought to this Committee on 20 September 2012.
- 1.4 The work of Internal Audit is required to be reported to a Member Body so that the Council has an opportunity to review and monitor an essential component of corporate governance and gain assurance that its internal audit provision is fulfilling its statutory obligations. It is considered good practice that progress reports also include proposed amendments to the agreed annual audit plan.

2. Audit Plan Update

Delivery of Audit Plan and Key Audit Findings

2.1 As at 9 November 2012, 41% of the 2012-13 Audit Plan days had been delivered. Appendix A provides a status update on each individual project within the audit plan.

2.2 The following 2012-13 reports and assignments have been issued in the period since 25 August 2012 (cut-off date of the last SIAS Update Report):

| Audit Title | Date of | Assurance | Number of |
|-------------|---------|-------------|------------------------|
| | Issue | Level | Recommendations |
| Careline | Aug '12 | Full | none |
| Utilities | Aug '12 | Substantial | two medium |
| | | | three merits attention |

| Housing Strategy | Sep '12 | Moderate | two medium |
|---------------------|---------|-------------|------------------------|
| Fees and Charges | Oct '12 | Full | none |
| Authorisations and | Oct '12 | Moderate | two medium |
| Delegations | | | six merits attention |
| Long-term Absence | Oct '12 | Substantial | three merits attention |
| Management | | | |
| Tree Maintenance | Oct '12 | Substantial | two medium |
| | | | two merits attention |
| Debt Recovery | Oct '12 | Substantial | one high |
| | | | one merits attention |
| Procurement | Oct '12 | Substantial | four medium |
| Baseline Assessment | | | |
| Mrs Howard Gardens | Nov '12 | Moderate | eight medium |
| | | | one merits attention |

High Priority Recommendations

- 2.3 Members will be aware that a Final Audit Report is issued when it has been agreed by management; this includes an agreement to implement the recommendations that have been made. It is SIAS's responsibility to bring to Members' attention the implementation status of high priority recommendations; it is the responsibility of Officers to implement the recommendations by the agreed date.
- 2.4 The standard template schedule attached at Appendix B shows the implementation status of previously agreed high priority audit recommendations, including those now assessed as complete and due to be removed from the list.

Proposed Audit Plan Amendments

2.5 The 2012-13 Audit Plan included an audit of Shared Services, however given recent developments, this audit is no longer considered to be relevant. Discussions are in progress to identify alternative areas of audit activity. If appropriate, a verbal update on this will be provided at the committee meeting.

Performance Management

- 2.6 Annual performance indicators and associated targets were approved by the SIAS Board in 2011.
- 2.7 As at 9 November 2012, the actual performance for North Herts against the targets that can be monitored in year was as shown in the table below.

| Performance Indicator | Annual Target | Profiled Target | Actual to 9 November 2012 |
|---|------------------|--------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. Planned Days – percentage of actual billable days against planned chargeable days completed (excluding unused contingency) | 95% | 45% | 41% |
| 2. Planned Projects – percentage of actual completed projects to draft report stage against planned completed projects | 95% | 40% | 35% |
| 3. Client Satisfaction – percentage of client satisfaction questionnaires returned at 'satisfactory' level | 100% | 100% | 100% |
| 4. Number of High Priority Audit Recommendations agreed | 95% | 95% | 100% |

- 2.8 In addition, the performance targets listed below are annual in nature. Performance against these targets will be reported on in the 2012-13 Head of Assurance's Annual Report:
 - **5. External Auditors' Satisfaction** the Annual Audit Letter should formally record whether or not the External Auditors are able to rely upon the range and the quality of SIAS' work.
 - **6. Annual Plan** prepared in time to present to the March meeting of each Audit Committee. If there is no March meeting then the plan should be prepared for the first meeting of the financial year.
 - 7. Head of Assurance's Annual Report presented at the Audit Committee's first meeting of the civic year.

2012-13 SIAS Audit Plan

| ALIDITADI E ADEA | LEVEL OF | | RECS | 5 | AUDIT | LEAD | BILLABLE | CTATUC/COMMENT |
|------------------------------------|-------------|---|------|---|--------------|---------------------|-------------------|-----------------------|
| AUDITABLE AREA | ASSURANCE | Н | M | L | PLAN DAYS | AUDITOR ASSIGNED | DAYS COMPLETED | STATUS/COMMENT |
| Key Financial Systems | | | | | | | | |
| Asset Management | | | | | 12 | Yes | 0.5 | Planning in progress |
| Council Tax | | | | | 12 | Yes | 5 | Fieldwork in progress |
| Creditors | | | | | 12 | Yes | 1.1 | Planning in progress |
| Debtors | | | | | 12 | Yes | 1.1 | Planning in progress |
| Housing Benefits | | | | | 12 | Yes | 1.6 | Planning in progress |
| Main Accounting | | | | | 12 | Yes | 1 | Planning in progress |
| NNDR | | | | | 12 | Yes | 0.4 | Planning in progress |
| Payroll | | | | | 12 | Yes | 1.5 | Planning in progress |
| Treasury | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0 | Planning in progress |
| Operational Audits | | | | | | | | |
| Authorisations and Delegations | Moderate | 0 | 2 | 6 | 12 | Yes | 12 | Final report issued |
| BACS | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0.8 | Planning in progress |
| Careline | Full | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10 | Yes | 10 | Final report issued |
| Data Protection | | | | | 12 | Yes | 0.9 | Planning in progress |
| Debt Recovery | Substantial | 1 | 0 | 1 | 12 | Yes | 12 | Final report issued |
| Environmental Enforcement | | | | | 5 | Yes | 0 | Planned for Q4 |
| Fees and Charges | Full | 0 | 0 | 0 | 12 | Yes | 12 | Final report issued |
| Financial Regulations Benchmarking | | | | | 4 | Yes | 3.8 | Draft report issued |
| Freedom of Information | | | | | 10 | Yes | 5.4 | Fieldwork in progress |

| | LEVEL OF | | RECS | 3 | AUDIT | LEAD | BILLABLE | |
|--|-------------|---|------|---|--------------|---------------------|-------------------|---|
| AUDITABLE AREA | ASSURANCE | Н | М | L | PLAN DAYS | AUDITOR ASSIGNED | DAYS COMPLETED | STATUS/COMMENT |
| Housing Strategy | Moderate | 0 | 2 | 0 | 6 | Yes | 6 | Final report issued |
| Learning and Development | Substantial | 0 | 2 | 2 | 8 | Yes | 8 | Final report issued |
| Licensing | | | | | 12 | Yes | 0 | Planned for Q4 |
| Long-term Absence Management | Substantial | 0 | 0 | 3 | 10 | Yes | 10 | Final report issued |
| Parking Strategy | | | | | 8 | | 0 | Timing to be confirmed |
| Performance Management | Substantial | 0 | 1 | 1 | 8 | Yes | 8 | Final report issued |
| Preparation for Universal Credits | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0.9 | Planning in progress |
| Shared Services | | | | | 15 | N/A | N/A | Audit to be cancelled – see section 2.5 |
| Utilities | Substantial | 0 | 2 | 3 | 6 | Yes | 6 | Final report issued |
| VAT | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0.6 | Planning in progress |
| Procurement | | | | | | | | |
| Procurement Baseline Assessment | Substantial | 0 | 4 | 0 | 15 | Yes | 15 | Final report issued |
| Grounds Maintenance | | | | | 10 | Yes | 0 | Planned for Q4 |
| Mrs Howard Gardens | Moderate | 0 | 8 | 1 | 10 | Yes | 10 | Final report issued |
| North Herts Museum Service | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0 | Planned for Q4 |
| Tree Maintenance | Substantial | 0 | 2 | 2 | 8 | Yes | 8 | Final report issued |
| Waste Management – Waste Transfer Station | | | | | 8 | Yes | 0 | Planned for Q4 |
| Counter Fraud | | | | | | | | |
| Fraud Baseline Assessment | | | | | 10 | Yes | 9 | Draft report issued |
| Risk Management & Governance | | | | | | | | |
| Corporate Governance | | | | | 12 | Yes | 0.9 | Planning in progress |

| | LEVEL OF | | RECS | 5 | AUDIT | LEAD | BILLABLE | |
|---|-----------------------------|---|------|---|--------------|---------------------|-------------------|------------------------|
| AUDITABLE AREA | ASSURANCE | Н | М | L | PLAN DAYS | AUDITOR ASSIGNED | DAYS COMPLETED | STATUS/COMMENT |
| IT Audits | | | | | | | | |
| IT Baseline Assessment | | | | | 10 | Yes | 0 | Due to start Jan 13 |
| IT Audit Needs Assessment | | | | | 10 | TBC | 0 | Timing to be confirmed |
| IT Helpdesk | | | | | 10 | Yes | 1.5 | Planning in progress |
| IT Penetration Testing | | | | | 6 | Yes | 3.5 | Fieldwork in progress |
| Completion of 2011-12 audits | | | | • | | | | |
| Asset Management 2011-12 | Substantial | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | Yes | 0 | Final report issued |
| Council Tax 2011-12 | Substantial | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0.5 | Yes | 0.5 | Final report issued |
| NNDR 2011-12 | Substantial | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0.5 | Yes | 0.5 | Final report issued |
| PWC completion work | | | | | 9 | N/A | 9 | Completed |
| Contingency | | | | • | | | | |
| North Herts Postal Votes | Not Assessed | | | | 2 | Yes | 2 | Completed |
| Additional work on Careline audit | See Careline | | | | 1 | Yes | 1 | Completed |
| Additional work on Procurement Baseline audit | See Procurement Baseline | | | | 1 | Yes | 1 | Completed |
| <3 hour queries | Not Assessed | | | | 3 | Yes | 0.4 | On-going |
| To be allocated | | | | | 13 | N/A | 0 | On-going |
| Follow Up Audits | | | | • | | | | |
| Follow up of high priority recommendations | | | | | 15 | N/A | 5.3 | On-going |
| Strategic Support | | | | | | | | |
| Strategic Support | | | | | 50 | N/A | 24.3 | On-going |
| NHDC TOTAL | | | | | 490 | | 200.5 | |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|---|---|---|------------------------|--|---|----------------------------------|
| 1 | Consultants (2010-11) | Appointments over £50,000 should be approved by the Corporate Management Team (or project board if applicable). | This requirement will be considered for inclusion in the next revision of Contract Procurement Rules. | Head of Finance, Performance & Asset Management | Dec 2011 | May 12: 2012-13 revision of Contract Procurement Rules planned for reporting to Sep 12 FAR Committee. Aug 12: Procurement rules update due to go to Contracts & Procurement Group (CPG) in Sep 12 and FAR Committee in Dec 12. Nov 12: Procurement rules update has gone to CPG for review. Plan is — Procurement Strategy to Dec 12 FAR Committee; | Contract Procurement Rules update awaiting final approval. Now expected Jan 13. | 80% complete Continue to monitor |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|--|---|--|------------------------|---|--|----------------------------------|
| | | | | | | Contract Procurement Rules update to Jan 13 FAR Committee. | | |
| 2 | Consultants (2010-11) | The Performance & Risk Manager should be consulted prior to any appointment to ensure that adequate insurances are in place and in order to comply with the Council's Contract Procurement Rules (30.2). Further guidance is given in Part H and in the Council's Procurement Guide. Commissioning officers should be reminded of this requirement. | Commissioning officers will be reminded of best practice. Intranet procurement pages will be updated as necessary to reinforce this requirement. Contract documents should make explicit the requirement to maintain professional indemnity insurance. | Procurement Officer & Contracts Solicitor | Aug 2011 | Jan 12: Reminders have been given via the Contracts & Procurement Group and will be factored into training. Aug 12: Procurement rules update due to go to Contracts & Procurement Group (CPG) n Sep 12 and FAR Committee in Dec 12. Nov 12: Procurement rules update has gone | Contracts & Procurement Group now meets regularly. The Council's Intranet pages have been updated. 2012-13 revision of Contract Procurement Rules awaiting final approval by the FAR Committee. Now expected Jan 13. | 80% complete Continue to monitor |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|--|--|---|------------------------|--|--|--|----------------------------------|
| | | | | | | to CPG for review. Plan is – Procurement Strategy to Dec 12 FAR Committee; Contract Procurement Rules update to Jan 13 FAR Committee. | | |
| 3 | Copyright Act – Software Licensing (26/09/11) | Record details of software held by the Council in the IT Asset Register. | I.T is developing an in-house software package which can accommodate both hardware and software assets. Phase 1 of this is complete and the I.T Business Team are currently carrying out a full audit of hardware assets and once this is complete software assets will | ICT Manager | Phase 1 – Software written Phase 2 – Physical floor walk Asset Audit which is due to be completed by end Sep 2011 Phase 3 – Commences mid Oct 2011 | Apr 12: IT is developing an in-house software package to accommodate hardware and software assets. Phase 1 is complete. The IT Business Team is currently carrying out a full audit of hardware assets. Once this is complete software | Software assets not yet tagged. Service Plan action to conclude this issue has been delayed as a result of resources allocated to shared services. | 66% complete Continue to monitor |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|---|---------------------------------|------------------------|
| | | | be tagged against the asset. | | | assets will be tagged. Nov 12: The addition of software licences is not complete. Software licences change on a regular basis and creation of a central register of what we currently hold is on the 12-13 Service Plan. As reported during the year, the I.T Service Plan is behind schedule due to shared services and the amount of work we had to put into this over the last 22 months. | | |
| 4 | Information Sharing | Produce an overarching guide on | It is possible to write an | IT Business Manager | Apr 2012 | Apr 12; Draft document | Guide agreed, signed-off and | Complete – remove from |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|--|--|------------------------|------------------------|---|------------------------------------|-----------------------|
| | (06/02/12) | information sharing requirements to inform staff, members, partners and contractors of their responsibility for effective data management. | overarching information sharing protocol. This will be a very high level document as the current data sharing protocols are very different due to the type of data that is involved and with what company / authority the data is being shared with. | | | reviewed and agreed by the Information Management Group on 30 March 2012. Draft with Head of Revenues, Benefits & IT for final approval before publication. Aug 12: Draft reviewed by the Head of Revenues, Benefits & IT and is on the SMT agenda for 4 September for formal adoption. Nov 12: The Information Sharing Protocol has been agreed by SMT and the Legal Team and is being rolled out to | currently being rolled out. | list |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|--|---|---|-----------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | | our partners via the Information Team. | | |
| 5 | Payroll (13/03/12) | Approval of the monthly BACS payroll payment to be in accordance with the Council's Authorised Signatory Listing. | Liaise with relevant authorised signatory (John Robinson, Strategic Director) to seek agreement for them to approve (by countersigning the BACS report) any payments in excess of HR Services Managers Limit. | HR Services Manager | Immediate and completed | None obtained | No BACS payroll payments over £700k since the audit. Therefore cannot test this control. | Progress cannot be verified Continue to monitor |
| 6 | Housing & Council Tax Benefits (23/02/12) | Write-offs to be approved in accordance with delegation limits listed in Financial Regulations. | Checks are the responsibility of the officer who receives the sheet back from the Head of Revenues, Benefits & IT. Staff have been reminded of the need to check that appropriate authorisation has | Systems & Technical Manager | Immediately | None | A revised write-off process has been agreed and implemented. This will be assessed during the forthcoming 2012-13 Revenues and Benefits audits. | 50% complete Continue to monitor |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|---|---|----------------------------------|------------------------|---|--|-----------------------------|
| | | | been obtained prior to writing off amounts. | | | | | |
| 7 | Creditors (16/07/12) | Supplier forms should be annotated to confirm that bank details have been independently verified. A report of new suppliers and of changes made to existing supplier standing data should be generated and be subject to independent review. | Agreed | Payment & Reconciliation Manager | Aug 2012 | Aug 12: Changes to bank details are now verified with the supplier and supplier forms annotated accordingly. A monthly check of changes to bank details will be undertaken by the Payments and Reconciliations Manager from August onwards. Nov 12: Monthly check by Payments and Reconciliations Manager now in operation. | Risk now mitigated by effective management controls. | Complete – remove from list |

| No. | Report Title / Date of Issue | Recommendation | Management Response | Responsible Officer | Implementation Date | History of Management Comments | SIAS Comment at 9 November 2012 | Status of Progress |
|-----|---------------------------------|---|---|------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------------|--|---|
| 8 | Debt Recovery (12/10/12) | The process for dealing with Housing Benefit Overpayments should be finalised and guidance procedures for both Sundry Debtor and Housing Benefit Overpayment Debt Recovery should be formally documented and distributed to the Revenues Recovery Team. | The process for Housing Benefit Overpayments will be finalised and once the procedures for both Sundry Debtor and Housing Benefit Overpayment Debt Recovery have been tested to ensure that they work, they will be distributed to all staff. | Revenues Manager | Jan 2013 | None requested | No update obtained as audit only recently concluded. | Progress not assessed - Continue to monitor |